April 5, 2017

Gordon County Board of Commissioners
Gordon County Commissioner Office
201 N. Wall Street
Calhoun, GA 30701

Disclaimer: The opinions expressed herein are our own and do not necessarily reflect the views of The Johns Hopkins University.

RE: Gordon County Moratorium on Livestock Operations

Dear Members of the Gordon County Board of Commissioners,

We are researchers at The Johns Hopkins Center for a Livable Future, based at the Bloomberg School of Public Health in the Department of Environmental Health and Engineering. The Center engages in research, policy analysis, education, and other activities guided by an ecologic perspective that diet, food production, the environment, and public health are interwoven elements of a complex system. We recognize the prominent role that food animal production plays regarding a wide range of public health issues surrounding that system.

We have been contacted by Gordon County, Georgia residents about the county’s moratorium on the approval or permitting of livestock operations. We understand that the county has a high density of broiler chicken operations (with an inventory of 9.6 million broilers in the county in 2012), and that there are several additional facility construction applications for broiler operations that have been approved and are expected to move forward once the moratorium is lifted. In response to concerns of county residents and in an effort to serve as a resource, we have summarized the primary public health concerns associated with industrial food animal production (IFAP), focusing especially on broiler production. An annotated bibliography is provided on pages 5-13.
Summary of Public Health Concerns Associated with IFAP

The primary public health concerns related to IFAP include: infections resulting from the transmission of harmful microorganisms from IFAP operations to nearby residents; respiratory problems resulting from increased exposure to air pollution from animal operations; and multiple negative human health impacts due to increased exposure to ground and/or surface waters that are contaminated by manure from IFAP operations. These concerns are described in greater detail below.

Disease Transmission
The poor conditions characteristic of IFAP operations, such as crowding, present opportunities for disease transmission among animals, and between animals and humans. 1,2 Those living near IFAP operations are vulnerable, especially if they live in close proximity to multiple operations, and may have an increased risk of infection from the transmission of harmful microorganisms from operations via filth flies or contaminated air and water. 3-7

Of additional concern is exposure to pathogens that are resistant to antibiotics used in human medicine. Administering antibiotics to animals at levels too low to treat disease (non-therapeutic use) is common practice in many IFAP operations to promote growth or prevent disease. This practice fosters the proliferation of antibiotic-resistant pathogens. Resistant infections in humans are more difficult and expensive to treat 8 and more often fatal 9 than infections with non-resistant strains. A large body of evidence provides support that antibiotic-resistant pathogens are found in IFAP operations that administer antibiotics for non-therapeutic purposes 10 and that such pathogens are also found in the environment in and around production facilities, specifically in the litter 11,12 and on flies. 13

Manure runoff from IFAP operations can introduce these harmful pathogens into nearby water sources. 11 Land application of manure presents a pathway for pathogens contained in the manure to leach into the ground or run off into recreational water and drinking water sources, potentially causing a waterborne disease outbreak. 11 This is of particular concern for the approximately 16% of Gordon County residents who rely on private wells for drinking water and household use 14; private wells are not routinely monitored by government agencies to ensure safe levels of pathogens.

Air Pollution
Community members living near IFAP operations also face increased exposure to air pollution from these operations, which can cause or exacerbate respiratory conditions including asthma 15,16; and bronchitis, and allergic reactions. 16 Air emissions from poultry IFAP operations include particulates, volatile organic compounds, and gases such as ammonia. 15,17
Contaminated Ground and Surface Water
The transition to large, high-density, confined animal feeding operations that tend to be clustered near processing facilities over the last several decades has resulted in the concentration of animal waste over small geographic areas. Although animal manure is an invaluable fertilizer when used in moderation, waste quantities of the magnitude produced by IFAP operations represent a public health and ecological hazard through the degradation of surface and ground water resources.

Manure from these operations can contaminate ground and surface waters with nitrates, drug residues, and other hazards, and studies have demonstrated that humans can be exposed to waterborne contaminants from livestock and poultry operations through the recreational use of contaminated surface water and the ingestion of contaminated drinking water. Exposure to elevated levels of nitrates in drinking water is associated with adverse health effects, including cancer, birth defects and other reproductive problems, thyroid problems, and methemoglobinemia.

Nutrient runoff (including nitrogen and phosphorus) has also been implicated in the growth of harmful algal blooms, which may pose health risks for people who swim or fish in recreational waters, or who consume contaminated fish and shellfish. Exposure to algal toxins has been linked to neurological impairments, liver damage, gastrointestinal illness, severe dermatitis, and other adverse health effects.

We hope that this description of public health concerns associated with IFAP is helpful. Through our research, we know that local agencies can face many barriers in addressing issues associated with IFAP operations due to narrow regulations and/or limited resources for monitoring impacts to public health and/or the environment. We are attaching a copy of a local ordinance that establishes health, safety, and welfare regulations for IFAP operations as an example of measures that have been taken by other local governments. Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

James D. Yager, PhD
Edyth H. Schoenrich Professor Emeritus
Acting Director, Johns Hopkins Center for a Livable Future
Professor & Deputy Chair, Department of Environmental Health & Engineering
Senior Associate Dean for Academic Affairs (2000–2013)
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
Johns Hopkins University

Robert S. Lawrence, MD, MACP
The Center for a Livable Future Professor Emeritus in Environmental Health & Engineering
Founding Director, Johns Hopkins Center for a Livable Future
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
Johns Hopkins University

**Robert Martin**
Senior Lecturer, Department of Environmental Health & Engineering
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
Program Director, Food System Policy
Johns Hopkins Center for a Livable Future
Johns Hopkins University

**Jillian P. Fry, PhD, MPH**
Assistant Scientist, Departments of Environmental Health & Engineering and Health, Behavior and Society
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
Project Director, Food Production and Public Health
Johns Hopkins Center for a Livable Future
Johns Hopkins University

**Claire M. Fitch, MSPH**
Senior Research Program Manager, Food System Policy
Johns Hopkins Center for a Livable Future
Johns Hopkins University
Department of Environmental Health & Engineering
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health

**Carolyn Hricko, MPH**
Research Assistant, Food System Policy
Johns Hopkins Center for a Livable Future
Johns Hopkins University
Department of Environmental Health & Engineering
Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
References

   Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/24350836

   This study sought to characterize the immunosuppressive effect of overcrowding stress in broiler chickens. Overcrowding was found to compromise the intestinal immune barrier and integrity of the small intestine, resulting in inflammation and decreased nutrient absorption. The study concludes that animal welfare measures and avoiding overcrowding stress factors in maintaining poultry health and decreased susceptibility to *Salmonella* infection.


   This study reviewed current knowledge to assess the potential impact of stress—such as that from inadequate nutrition, deprivation of water and/or feed, heat, cold, overcrowding, handling and transport—in farm animals on food safety risk. The review focused on stress mechanisms influencing the colonization and shedding of enteric pathogens in food animals due to the potential for their dissemination into the human food chain, a serious public health and economic concern. The review concluded that there is a growing body of evidence that demonstrates the negative impact of stress on food safety through a variety of potential mechanisms, and recommends additional research to optimize animal welfare and minimize production loses and food safety risks.

   Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20701843

   The results of this study support the hypothesis that current methods of food animal transport from farm to slaughterhouse result in the transfer of bacteria, including antibiotic-resistant bacteria, to the vehicles travelling the same road. Bacteria were isolated from air and surface samples from vehicles following open poultry trucks, suggesting a new route of exposure to pathogens and the further dissemination of these pathogens to the general environment.

   Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/18087592
Occupational and environmental pathways of human exposure to antimicrobial-resistant bacteria were explored in this study by comparing the relative risk of antimicrobial-resistant E. coli among poultry workers compared with community referents. The study concluded that occupational exposure to antimicrobial-resistant bacteria may be an important route of entry for the bacteria into the community, as poultry workers had 32 times the odds of carrying resistant E. coli compared to the community referents.


This study examined the extent of microbial atmospheric pollution caused by industrial broiler breeding operations and found that as birds aged, microbial numbers increased in the indoor air and were spread into the environment to a greater degree. The study also found that microorganisms could be spread by air flow up to 3000 meters from the production buildings.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/15156064

Objectionable odors, flies, excessive levels of nitrogen and phosphorus and the potential spread of human pathogens are among the public concerns with the disposal of animal manure and the spread of dust and manure blown from powerful building fans. The study also finds that importance of animal manure in the spread of infectious pathogens is often underestimated despite the linkages between livestock operations and gastroenteritis in humans.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19006971

The transition of food animal production from small-scale methods to industrial-scale operations has been accompanied by substantial evidence of the transfer of pathogens between and among industrial food animal facilities, the environment, and exposure to farm workers. This challenges the notion that modern animal production is more biosecure than smaller operations in regards to the introduction and release of pathogens. The study concludes that industrialized food animal production risk factors must be included in strategies to mitigate or prevent the emergence of pandemic avian influenza.

Medical and societal costs attributable to antimicrobial-resistant infections are considerable, and important factors in understanding the potential benefits of prevention programs. Medical costs attributable to antimicrobial-resistant infections range from $18,588 to $29,069 per patient, hospital stay durations from 6.4-12.7 days, and mortality of 6.5%. Societal costs were estimated at $10.7-$15 million.


Healthcare costs of methicillin-resistant S. aureus (MRSA) infections and methicillin-susceptible S. aureus (MSSA) were compared in this study. MRSA infections were found to be independently associated with higher costs, more comorbidities, and higher likelihood of death than MSSA infections.


Halting fluoroquinolone use was not found to have an impact on the proportion of fluoroquinolone-resistant Campylobacter on products from the conventional producers, indicating that antibiotic-resistant bacteria may persistently contaminate poultry products even after on-farm use of the antibiotic has ceased. Also, Campylobacter strains from the conventional producers were more likely to be resistant to fluoroquinolone than those from the antibiotic-free producers, indicating that antibiotic use in food animal production contributes to the develop of antibiotic-resistant pathogens.


This EPA report on the environmental occurrence and potential effects of livestock and poultry manure related contaminants on water quality found that 60-70% of manure nitrogen and phosphorus may not be assimilated by the farmland where it was generated due to the increasing concentration of industrial animal production. The report also notes the variety of pathogens contained in livestock and poultry manure, as well as the potential for their spread to humans when surface and groundwater and food crops come into contact with manure through runoff, spills, and land-application of manure. It also refers to research indicating that antimicrobial use in livestock and poultry production has contributed to the occurrence of anti-microbial resistant pathogens in animal operations and nearby environments. The report also presents that manure discharge to surface waters can occur by various means and have deleterious effects on aquatic life and
contribute to toxic algal blooms harmful to animals, and to humans when exposed via contact with contaminated drinking water or recreational use of contaminated water.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19541298

This study examined the survival of anti-microbial resistant enterococci and staphylococci and resistance genes in poultry litter to better understand how land application of poultry litter can affect the surrounding populations environment. The study found that poultry litter storage practices do not eliminate drug-resistant bacterial strains, thus allowing the spread of these drug-resistant pathogens into and through the environment via land application of poultry litter.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19157515

This study examined if and how antibiotic resistant bacteria are transferred from poultry operations to nearby communities, and found that flies caught near poultry operations carried the same drug-resistant pathogens as those found in poultry litter. The study concludes that flies may be an important vector in the spread of drug resistant bacteria from poultry operations and may increase human exposure to these resistant pathogens.


This United States Geological Survey website provides national water use data by area type (aquifer, watershed, county, state), source (rivers or groundwater), and category such as irrigation or public supply.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1817709/

This report from a Conference on Environmental Health Impacts of Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations: Anticipating Hazards—Searching for Solutions working group states that toxic gases, vapors and particles are emitted from CAFOs into the general environment, and that while these agents are known to be harmful to human health, there are few studies that explore the health risks of exposure to these agents for the people living near CAFOs. While there is evidence that psychophysilogic changes may result from exposure to malodors and that microbial exposures are related to deleterious respiratory health effects, the working group concluded that there is great need to study and evaluate the health effects of community exposure to these CAFO related air
pollutants to better understand the impact of CAFOs on the health of community members and farm workers.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19656601

This paper reviews research on particulate matter inside and emitted from livestock production system and reports that livestock housing is an important source of particulate matter emissions. The paper recommends additional research to characterize and control particulate matter in livestock houses, as high concentrations such as those found in livestock houses can threaten the environment and the health and welfare of humans and animals.

Link: https://www.cdc.gov/nceh/ehs/docs/understanding_cafos_nalboh.pdf

The National Association of Local Boards of Health produced this report with the support of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and the National Center for Environmental Health to assist local board of health members better understand their role in mitigating potential issues with CAFOs. The report concludes that large-scale industrial food animal production can cause numerous public health and environmental problems and should thus be monitored to prevent harm to surrounding communities. Suggested actions include passing ordinances and regulations, and increasing water and air quality monitoring and testing. The report also concludes that local boards of health, in collaboration with state and local agencies, are an appropriate body for instituting these actions due to the local nature of CAFO concerns and risks.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20705978

Trends affecting food animal waste production, risks associated with food-animal wastes, and differences between food-animal waste and human biosolid management practices were examined in this study. The study found that no standards exist for the 335 million tons of food animal waste applied to land in the US, while human biosolids, which make up just 1% of all land-applied wastes, are subject to standards. Hormones, arsenicals, high nutrient loads, antibiotics, and pathogens, including antibiotic-resistant pathogens, are often present in animal waste. The authors made recommendations for improving management of food-animal waste through existing and new policies.

This work-group, part of the Conference on Environmental Health Impacts of Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations: Anticipating Hazards—Searching for Solutions, found that current and generally accepted livestock waste management practices do not protect water resources from the pathogens, pharmaceuticals and excessive nutrients found in animal waste. As concern about the potential human and environmental health impact of long-term exposure to contaminated water grows, there is greater need for rigorous monitoring of CAFOs, improved understanding of the major toxicants affecting human and environmental health, and a system to enforce these practices.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3068045/

Nitrate, the breakdown product of nitrogen fertilizers, accumulates in groundwater under agricultural land and can spread through waterways due to agricultural field runoff. Nitrates are associated with a range of adverse health effects, including methemoglobinemia, various cancers, negative reproductive outcomes, diabetes, and thyroid conditions. Additional research is needed to further evaluate the health effects of nitrate exposure, especially as environmental exposure to nitrates has increased over the last 50 years and 90% of rural Americans depend on groundwater for drinking water, many relying on private wells, which are not regulated by the Safe Drinking Water Act.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/17497410

The association between bladder cancer mortality and nitrate exposure from Taiwan drinking water was investigated in this study. The results showed a significant positive relationship between the levels of nitrates in the drinking water and the risk of death from bladder cancer, indicating that environmental exposure to nitrates plays a role in the development of bladder cancer.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2879161/

This study examined the association between nitrate intake through public water and diet with the risk of thyroid cancer and hypo- and hyperthyroidism. The study found an increased risk of thyroid cancer with high water nitrate levels and with longer consumption of water containing nitrates. The increased intake of dietary nitrate was associated with an increased risk of thyroid cancer, and with the prevalence of hypothyroidism.

This ecologic study was conducted to assess the association between nitrate levels in drinking water with non-Hodgkin lymphoma and cancers of the digestive and urinary tracts in an agricultural district. The study found that a higher incidence of some cancers was associated with higher levels of nitrate in drinking water. The trend was found in women for overall cancer cases, stomach cancer, colorectal cancer and non-Hodgkin lymphoma, and in men for non-Hodgkin lymphoma and colorectal cancer.


The relationship between maternal exposure to nitrates through drinking water and adverse reproductive and developmental outcomes was reviewed in this study. Animal studies support the association between nitrate exposure and adverse reproductive effects, and some studies report an association between nitrates in drinking water and spontaneous abortion, intrauterine growth restriction and various birth defects, though a direct exposure-response relationship remains unclear and there is insufficient evidence to establish a causal relationship.


The relationship between prenatal exposure to nitrates in drinking water and birth defects was examined in this study. The study concluded that higher maternal water nitrate consumption was associated with birth defects, including spina bifida, limb deficiency, cleft palate, and cleft lip.


Two cases of infant methemoglobinemia associated with nitrate contaminated private well water were described in this paper. The case studies underscore the danger that this contaminated water poses to infants during the first six months of life, as well as the risks of long-term exposure, which include cancer, thyroid disease and diabetes. Steps to reduce nitrate inputs in groundwater and routine well water testing are recommended to protect health.

The US EPA held a roundtable discussion to develop consensus among academic, federal and state agency representatives on the relationship between eutrophication and harmful algal blooms. Seven statements were adopted during the session, which include acknowledgement of the important role of nutrient pollution and degraded water quality in the development and persistence of many harmful algal blooms.

Link: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/20018091095087

Current understandings of cyanobacteria toxin poisonings (CTPs) and their risk to human health were reviewed in this paper. CTPs occur in fresh and brackish waters throughout the world as a result of eutrophication and climate change. Cyanobacteria toxins are responsible for acute lethal, acute, chronic and sub-chronic poisonings of wild and domestic animals and humans. These poisonings result in respiratory and allergic reactions, gastrointestinal disturbances, acute hepatotoxicosis and peracute neurotoxicosis.

Link: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12805693

This paper reviews the effects of harmful freshwater algal blooms, resulting from nutrient oversupply and eutrophication, on water quality. Algal blooms contribute to water quality degradation, including malodor and foul taste, fish kills, toxicity, and food web alterations, while algal bloom toxins can adversely affect human and animal health through exposure to contaminated recreational and drinking water. The control and management of blooms, and their negative outcomes, must include nutrient input constraints, particularly on nitrogen and phosphorus.

Link: http://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0054720

The role of local and state health departments in responding to and preventing community concerns with industrial food animal production are explored in this study through qualitative interviews with state and county health department staff and community members in eight states. Political barriers, lack of jurisdiction, and limited resources, expertise and staff all limit health departments’ ability to respond to IFAP concerns, while community members reported difficulty in engaging with health
departments. These limitations and difficulties contribute to limited health department engagement on these issues.

Link: http://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0089870

This study explored how state permitting and agriculture agencies respond to environmental public health concerns regarding industrial food animal production through qualitative interviews with state agency staff in seven states. The study found that the agencies were unable to adequately address these environmental public health concerns due to narrow regulations, limited resources and a lack of public health expertise. When these constraints are considered alongside those faced by health departments, significant gaps in the ability to respond to and prevent public health concerns and issues are revealed.